

Full Length Research Paper

Comparison of seventh-grade Turkish and Iranian social studies textbooks in terms of value education

Kemal Kaya

Department of Teaching Turkish and Social Studies, Faculty of Education, Van Yuzuncu Yil University, Turkey.

Received 13 September, 2019; Accepted 28 October, 2019

One of the objectives of comparative education research is to compare within a certain period of time educational systems that have developed in similar or different environments and processes. The aim of this qualitative study is to compare the value education in Turkish and Iranian seventh-grade social studies textbooks. Data were collected using document analysis. Results show that both books underscore the values of scientificity, sensitivity and responsibility. Unlike the Turkish social studies textbook, the Iranian social studies textbook addresses the religious aspects of those values as well. The Iranian social studies textbook also highlights the values 30% more than its Turkish counterpart. This article examining textbooks is limited to determining the placement of values; it is not intended to measure the effectiveness of textbooks in the formation of attitudes.

Key words: Social studies curriculum, social studies textbook, Turkey, Iran, values.

INTRODUCTION

Comparative education goes back a long way and is believed to originate from observations and exotic stories of ancient travelers of antiquity and from the adaptation of courses inspired by foreign applications (Noah and Eckstein, 1969). Comparative education is mostly associated with art because it dominates learning and teaching practices (Hilker, 1962). Comparative education research has gone through different stages throughout history. The nineteenth century witnessed the first stage, where the propositions of Marc-Antoine Jullien de Paris in 1817 are considered the earliest scientific studies on the issue (Kaloyannaki and Kazamias; 2009). The comparative education research of the nineteenth century focused on collecting, comparing and documenting education systems to ensure that good practices are

accessible to others as well. Borrowing an education system was considered practical or pragmatic in the nineteenth century, which is therefore also referred to as the "period of borrowing" (Fraser and Brickman, 1968).

The first half of the twentieth century witnessed the second stage, which is also referred to as the prediction period of comparative education research. The dominant premise of this stage was that not every education system can be borrowed and that the relationship between society and education should be taken into account when borrowing an education system. The pioneers of this field, Sir Michael Sadler and his successors Friedrich Schneider from Germany and Robert Ulich from the United States believed that every educational system was based on a wider world of social

E-mail: kemalkaya@yyu.edu.tr.

Author(s) agree that this article remain permanently open access under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)

and cultural causes, and therefore, they suggested that some filters be used instead of borrowing an education system directly. Inspired by Sadler and his successors, the comparative educators of that period took into account the results of research before adapting the experiences of an education system to another country and focused on predicting the achievements of that education system instead of borrowing it. Educators of the period concentrated also on foreign experiences because they aimed to protect themselves from harmful effects while analyzing the achievements and failures of other education systems (Farjad, 2000). Educational experiences vary across cultures and depend on cultural background and intelligence.

The third stage of comparative education, aka the period of analysis, corresponds to the twenty-first century, when educators focus on developing the relationship between countries due to the increase in international relations (Arno, 1999). Many authors, such as Schneider and Kandel, argue that sensitivity arising from comprehensive analyses can help reduce the obstacles of nation-centered perspectives and contribute to the development of international understanding (Rust et al., 2009).

In today's rapidly connecting world, comparative education can contribute to international peace and social justice. There is nothing wrong with states defining education from a humanist perspective rather than a capitalist perspective and being inspired by the successful implementation of other education systems and focusing on the well-being of their peoples, cultures, economies and policies while developing their own education systems.

The Turkish dictionary defines the term "value" as an abstract measure to determine the significance of something or worth that corresponds to something while society defines it as a belief that determines whether something is desired or not (Güngör, 1993). It is, however, defined and classified in different ways in the literature. Values are defined as generalized basic moral principles that are deemed necessary by the majority of the members of a community or society for their survival, unity, functioning and continuity or as beliefs that symbolize their common feelings, thoughts, goals and interests (Kızılcılık and Erjem, 1994). In social sciences, values are defined as the criteria used to guide and determine people's behavior and to assess people and events or as high-level concepts and objects that symbolize ideal and desirable behaviors and lifestyles, and specific concrete conditions and general principles that help people make the right decisions (İmamoğlu and Karakitapoğlu, 1999). Values are not individual aspirations or tastes, but are universal elements accepted by groups or societies as good and desirable for all (Silah, 2000). According to Durkheim, one of the basic conditions that make a mass of people into a society is the presence of sufficient homogeneity among those people. Undoubtedly,

education plays an important role in creating that homogeneity. It also passes down social values and culture from generation to generation, ensures social cohesion and leads society towards common goals (Tezcan, 1997) because schools provide students with the opportunity to socialize and adopt social values (Ercan, 2001). Schools are responsible for teaching the values that have been clearly stated, or not stated, in the curriculum for culture transfer, disciplining students in accordance with rules, contributing to their moral development and shaping their characters and self-perception in a desired manner (Akbaş, 2004).

As is known, curricula provide and limit the qualifications that students are expected to develop. The main source of textbooks is the curriculum. Teachers and their tools and materials play a key role in helping students learn the knowledge, skills, values and attitudes in curricula. The most commonly used materials are textbooks (Kılıç and Seven, 2002) because students spend most of their time in school with textbooks. Shannon (1982; in Ho and Hsu, 2011: 93) reported that students spent 70-95% of their time in classrooms on activities based on textbooks. Adıgüzel (2010) and Karaca (2011) found that teachers in Turkey generally used textbooks to teach. In fact, textbook-based education in both countries is a legacy of traditional Islamic education. A challenging examination system together with textbook-based education is a fundamental approach adopted by both countries to raise students' awareness of values and encourage them to internalize them. Therefore, social studies and equivalent courses, which provide a lot of knowledge, skills and values, are offered to students in many countries (United States, Australia, New Zealand, Finland, France, Turkey, Iran etc.). One of the objectives of comparative education research is to compare, within a certain period of time, educational systems that have developed in similar or different environments and processes. Although Turkey and Iran have undergone similar modernization processes, they claim to belong to and represent different worlds of thought. The aim of this study was, therefore, to compare Turkish and Iranian seventh-grade social studies textbooks in terms of value education.

Based on the significance of social life, values play a key role in the education systems of many states today. The National Council for the Social Studies (NCSS; 1994, 2010) prepared in the USA clearly specifies what values should be taught in schools, especially in social studies education. The values that should be taught directly in the social studies programs in Turkey are taught with reference to related learning areas. The social studies curriculum introduced in 2005 for 4-5 and 6-7 grades specifies the values that should be taught to students and treats the values and their teaching under a separate heading (MoNE, 2011). Of all primary, secondary and elementary social studies curricula in the Republican period, it is the first to directly include values education.

However, the curriculum revised in 2017 and introduced in 2018 makes more mention of values. The textbooks successfully capture the values stated in the objectives and explanations of the curriculum and presented on the basis of grade levels (MoNE, 2018).

Previous studies

Research on values education has been conducted for a long time in most developed countries. However, it has increased in Turkey only in the last two decades (Akengin et al., 2009; Baydar, 2009; Demircioğlu and Tokdemir, 2008; Demirhan, 2011; Dilmaç, 2007; Dilmaç and Ekşi, 2007; Doğanay, 2006; Ekşi, 2003; Kale, 2007; Kan, 2010; Katılmış et al., 2010; Kenan, 2009; Kıncal and Işık, 2005; Koç, 2007; Sarı, 2005; Tezgel, 2006; Topkaya and Yavuz, 2011; Tozlu and Topsakal, 2007; Yiğittir and Öcal, 2011). Çelikkaya (2016), Çelikkaya and Esen (2017) and Çelikkaya and Kürümlüoğlu (2018) investigated what values were addressed in the fourth- and fifth-grade social studies textbooks, what preservice social studies teachers thought about those values, and in what way proverb and idioms were included in the curricula. Aktan and Padem (2013) focused on the values in the texts in the primary school fifth grade textbook while Topkaya and Tokcan (2013) investigated how often the sixth grade social studies textbook addressed values. As can be seen, these studies focus on the pre-2018 curricula and textbooks and do not make any comparative analysis. Moreover, there is no research on the seventh-grade social studies textbooks.

Turkey has a lot in common with its eastern neighbor, Iran, in terms of social structure and cultural codes. However, they have constructed a different sense of belonging and representation throughout history. The social studies textbooks currently used in Iran were rewritten after 1979 to make children adopt a narrowly defined state ideology. The objective of the Iranian textbooks is to create citizens who have adopted the values and appropriate political stance approved by the state. The Iranian government prioritizes certain values to achieve individual and social transformation in line with certain objectives, which clearly shows that textbooks are used for political agendas (Mehran, 1989; Mirfakhraie, 2016).

Research shows that social studies education in democratic states, such as the USA, highlights social and democratic values rather than individual ones (Merey et al., 2012). According to Parker (2009), the role of social studies education becomes more and more ambiguous as we move from social to individual values because the latter play a key role in individual decisions. Social studies curricula and textbooks, should therefore, by their very nature, promote general values, not individual ones.

In recent years, there has been an increase in the number of studies on values in the Iranian social studies curriculum and textbooks (Mehran, 1990, 2003; Higgins

and Shoar-Ghaffari, 1996; Zarean, 1998; Hakimzadeh and Mousavi, 2009; Mehrmohammadi, 2013; Azadmanesh and Husseini, 2014; Mirfakhraie, 2015; Imani, 2017; Yazdani and Maryam, 2017). Hedayati et al. (2017a) demonstrated the significance of value education in teacher education. Sarlak and Saadatmand (2013) conducted a content analysis to address citizenship education in the Iranian primary and secondary school social studies textbooks. Soltan-zadeh and Farouk (2010) identified the national and Islamic concepts in the Iranian social studies textbooks. Mehran (2010) determined how the pre-2010 Iranian social studies textbooks portrayed Arabs.

Significance of the study

Comparative studies on values address value priorities of people with different cultural backgrounds (Schwartz, 1992; Schwartz et al., 2001), values in social studies curricula in Turkey and US (Merey et al., 2012) and citizenship and its education in Turkey and Iran (Suphi, 2010; Genç, 2018). There are very few comparative studies on curriculum and social studies textbooks in terms of values education. We, therefore, believe that determining to what extent the Turkish and Iranian social studies textbooks focus on value education and what values they emphasize will help to fill that gap in the literature and pave the way for further research. However, there are no studies comparing value education in social studies textbooks in different countries, especially in Turkey and Iran. We, therefore, believe that this study will fill the gap in the literature and provide insight for further studies.

METHODOLOGY

Research design

This was a case study. Case study is a qualitative research method used to understand a social phenomenon in its natural setting. It allows detailed descriptions and convincing generalizations through syntheses that help in-depth understanding of a context and phenomenon (Büyüköztürk et al., 2008). The objective is to describe a sample in detail (Bloor and Wood, 2006). The aim of this study was, therefore, to accept Turkish and Iranian seventh-grade social studies textbooks as phenomena and put forward results based on their comparison.

Participants

The current editions of Turkish and Iranian seventh-grade social studies textbooks were provided. Turkish and Iranian students do not take social studies courses at the same age. For example, eighth-grade Turkish students are offered the Revolution History course instead of the social studies course. However, eighth-grade Iranian students are offered the social studies course. The study sample consisted of Turkish and Iranian seventh-grade social studies textbooks because Turkish and Iranian seventh-grade students are of the same age.

Table 1. Learning areas of Iranian and Turkish social studies curricula.

| Turkish seventh-grade social studies textbook | Iranian seventh-grade social studies textbook |
|--|--|
| Individual and Society | Space and Place |
| Culture and Heritage | Time, Continuity and Change |
| People, Places and Settings | Culture and Identity |
| Production, Distribution and Consumption | Social order |
| Science, Technology and Society | Resources and Economic Activities |
| Active Citizenship | |
| Global Connections | |

The objective of the social studies curriculum updated in 2017 in Turkey is to turn students into individuals who adapt to social and economic conditions and play active roles in the face of rising international competition. The current conditions have led countries to seek educational models that help raise innovative individuals with critical thinking skills who have the ability to take responsibility, solve problems and make decisions. The Ministry of National Education (MoNE, 2018) defines the main objective of the social studies curriculum as transforming students into individuals who feel a genuine sense of commitment to the society in which they live, use science and technology effectively, possess technical knowledge and skills and are aware that being an individual also means belonging to a larger global family. The Turkish seventh-grade social studies textbook (Tsst, 2018) based on the updated curriculum consists of 7 learning areas divided into 7 units and 43 topics.

The Iranian social studies curriculum was revised, and the textbook was rewritten in 2017. The new curriculum based on constructivism defines the social studies course as an important course that discusses the events (political, economic, economic, cultural and environmental) that take place in different times (now, past and future). It mostly addresses history, geography, civilization, law and human science. As in Turkey, the Iranian social studies course is associated with other courses. The Iranian social studies textbook based on the new social studies curriculum consists of 5 learning areas, 12 chapters and 22 units, each associated with other subjects. The main objective of the Iranian national education social studies curriculum is to inform students about personal and social fields of education within the framework of a unitary belief required by human nature. The aim of the social studies course is to transform students into devout and responsible individuals who protect the ethical and religious values and interests of Iran and its cultural identity in personal and social spheres. The social studies course is described as closely related to life skills (Isst, 2018) (Table 1).

Data collection and analysis

Data were collected using document analysis. Document analysis is a qualitative research method used to analyze written materials that contain information about a phenomenon or phenomena of interest (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2005).

The objective of induction analysis is to reach concepts and relationships that can explain data. Induction analysis was used in this study, in which data were coded, themes were developed, organized and defined according to codes and themes, and results were interpreted (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2005).

Validity of the instrument

A form was developed to examine the values in the Turkish and

Iranian social studies curricula. The form is based on 18 (eighteen) values which both curricula aim to help students to develop. In qualitative studies, observations and interviews should be conducted by more than one person in order to increase internal validity and minimize observer bias (Büyükoztürk et al., 2008). For analysis, the researcher read all the learning outcomes in the textbooks and encoded the overt, covert and associative learning outcomes concerning the values onto the related value box. Two more experts, who have conducted research on this subject matter, read and coded the textbooks as well. The results of the three analyses were compared for compliance. The number of agreements and disagreements was determined, and interrater reliability was calculated using the formula $[\text{Reliability} = (\text{number of agreements}) / (\text{number of agreements} + \text{number of disagreements})]$ suggested by Miles and Huberman (1994). A score higher than 70% indicates acceptable interrater reliability (Miles and Huberman, p. 64). The interrater reliability in this study was found to be 0.81. For the codes on which there was disagreement, a fourth expert coded the values. These codes were combined to develop subthemes under the eighteen values in the Turkish and Iranian social studies textbooks. The results section includes direct quotes from the books regarding the values (Table 2).

RESULTS

Results regarding seventh-grade social studies textbooks

The Turkish and Iranian social studies textbooks address the values below at varying rates (Table 3).

Justice

The Turkish social studies textbook addresses the value of “justice (7)” seven times under the subthemes of “justice by law” and “being fair to others.” Some quotes from the textbook are “*It strives to increase social justice*” (Tsst, 2018: 208), “*His fairness and the laws that he enacted earned him the title of ‘Kanuni’ (Rightful)*” (Tsst, 2018: 59) and “*He guaranteed peoples’ right to believe and made sure that the courts acted with justice and that no one was discriminated against in the Ottoman Empire*” (Tsst, 2018: 200).

The Iranian social studies textbook highlights the value of “justice” under the subthemes of “fairness,” “being fair in weighing and measuring” and “ruling with justice.” The

Table 2. Sample.

| Code | Subtheme | Theme | |
|--|----------------------------------|---------------|--|
| Scientific thinking became increasingly important, and numerous scientific studies were carried out in Europe, which paved the way for the Age of Enlightenment. Critical thinking developed. | Appreciating scientific thinking | Scientificity | |
| Reason was the dominant force, and scientific research focused on nature and experiments and observations in the Age of Enlightenment | | | |
| Galileo described the Earth revolving around the sun in his book published in 1610. | Appreciating scientists | | |
| Dr. Harvey conducted research in the field of medicine in 1628 | | | |
| Harezmi (780-850) is a scholar of mathematics, astronomy and geography. Descartes invented analytic geometry | | | |
| Farabi is considered one of the greatest philosophers of human history | | | |
| The advances in science and technology in the Age of Enlightenment paved the way for the Industrial Revolution | Modernization | | |
| The Ottoman Empire was, in fact, not completely indifferent to the scientific developments in the world and to the Age of Enlightenment in Europe. The greatest proof of this is the establishment of a modern observatory in the late sixteenth century | | | |

Table 3. Values and their rate of appearance in Turkish and Iranian social studies textbooks.

| Values | Justice | Caring for Family Unity | Independence | Peace | Scientificity | Diligence | Solidarity | Sensitivity | Honesty | Aesthetics | Equality | Freedom | Respect | Love | Responsibility | Frugality | Patriotism | Altruism | Total |
|--------|---------|-------------------------|--------------|-------|---------------|-----------|------------|-------------|---------|------------|----------|---------|---------|------|----------------|-----------|------------|----------|-------|
| Turkey | 7 | 2 | 5 | 4 | 52 | 3 | 7 | 14 | - | 8 | 13 | 30 | 7 | 1 | 15 | - | 2 | 7 | 177 |
| Iran | 9 | 21 | 2 | 1 | 32 | 5 | 9 | 55 | 2 | 23 | 8 | 4 | 10 | 4 | 53 | 13 | 11 | 10 | 272 |

textbook contains such sentences as “*Our school administrators and teachers advise us to treat everyone morally and fairly*” (Isst, 2018: 5). It also alludes to the verse in Qur'an that commands fairness in weighing and states “*We should not sin by being wrongful in weighing and overcharging people*” (Isst, 2018: 36) and gives an example “*Kuroş, who was a powerful sultan, ruled humanly and justly the land that he conquered*” (Isst, 2018: 119).

Caring for family unity

The Turkish social studies textbook stresses the

value of “caring for family unity” under the subtheme of “care for family” with such statements as “*Family is the foundation of the Turkish society*” (Tsst, 2018: 85) and “*Women have a very respectable position as a result of the value given to family*” (Tsst, 2018: 85).

The Iranian social studies textbook also underscores the value of “caring for family unity” under the subtheme of “care for family.” It contains such expressions as “*Parents are good friends who love us, and when we get sick, they provide us with medication for our recovery*” (Isst, 2018: 3) and “*In ancient Iran, family was the cornerstone of society*” (Isst, 2018: 132).

Independence

The Turkish social studies textbook highlights the value of “independence (5)” under the subthemes of “personal independence” and “judicial independence.” Some quotes from the textbook are as follows: “*By identifying children as independent individuals in the society in which they live*” (Tsst, 2018: 33) and “*The execution of judiciary by independent courts proves the presence of the rule of law in our country*” (Tsst, 2018: 209).

The Iranian social studies textbook underlines the value of “independence (2)” under the

subtheme of “independence of the country” with such statements as “*It is our duty to protect the unity and independence of the country*” (Isst, 2018: 9) and “*and Canşiyân Eşk gradually freed his country from the domination of the Selocyan people and finally made it independent*” (Isst, 2018: 121)

Peace

The Turkish social studies textbook makes a mention of the value of “peace (4)” under the subthemes of “social peace” and “world peace” as it states “*The Ottoman Empire was also referred to as ‘Pax Ottomana’ (literally ‘the Ottoman Peace’) because it managed to keep many nations together*” (Tsst, 2018: 62) and “*UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization) declared 1981 as the Year of the World Peace because it was the centennial of the birth of Mustafa Kemal Atatürk*” (Tsst, 2018: 220).

The Iranian social studies textbook stresses the value of “peace (1)” under the subtheme of “world peace” and states “*In addition to all these services, the Red Crescent makes an effort to maintain peace and friendship*” (Isst, 2018: 24).

Scientificity

Scientificity (52) is the value emphasized most by the Turkish social studies textbook under the subthemes of “appreciating scientific thinking,” “appreciating scientists” and “modernization.” The textbook states “*Reason was the dominant force and scientific research focused on nature and experiments and observations in the Age of Enlightenment*.” (Tsst, 2018: 70), “*Descartes invented analytic geometry*” (Tsst, 2018: 70) and “*The Ottoman Empire was in fact not completely indifferent to the scientific developments in the world and to the Age of Enlightenment in Europe. The greatest proof of this is the establishment of a modern observatory in the late sixteenth century*” (Tsst, 2018: 70).

The Iranian social studies textbook emphasizes the value of “scientificity (32)” under the subthemes of “scientific studies,” “definitions,” “proof,” “sources of information,” “scientists” and “characteristics of scientific knowledge.” The textbook states that many products, such as health care and television, are the products of scientific endeavors and address various scientific definitions. It emphasizes the value of “scientificity” through such statements as “*The ancient Iranians had made progress in the fields of science (mathematics, engineering, geology etc.)*” (Isst, 2018: 152), “*The questions of geography are...*” (Isst, 2018: 46) and “*How is soil formed?*” (Isst, 2018: 86). The fifth section “*Let’s Learn Where We Live*” argues that spheres, books and dictionaries, and the Internet and CDs are important resources of scientific information about geography. It

refers to sources of information by stating “*CDs provide us with very useful information about geography*” (Isst, 2018: 49), “*Today, the internet allows us to access information, photographs, maps and even films*” (Isst, 2018: 49) and “*Sources show us that Iran was home to great civilizations in ancient times*” (Isst, 2018: 112). The textbook also talks about climatologists (Isst, 2018: 61), historians (Isst, 2018: 98, 105, 106) and ancient historians and their ideas. The textbook highlights the “characteristics of scientific knowledge” by stating “*Historians sometimes change their knowledge according to new documents and findings*” (Isst, 2018: 105).

Diligence

The Turkish social studies textbook highlights the value of “diligence (3)” under the subtheme of “will to work” with such statements as “*But he did not give up and continued to work*” (Tsst, 2018: 147) and “*Although those people had to deal with many difficulties, they did not give up and instead devoted most of their time to their work*” (Tsst, 2018: 149).

The Iranian social studies textbook makes a mention of the value of “diligence (3)” under the subtheme of “will to work” as well. It contains such statements as “*I should listen to my teacher’s advice and study my lessons and get high grades*” (Isst, 2018: 8) and “*If people did not have the will to work and did not try hard, they would not survive*” (Isst, 2018: 33).

Solidarity

The Turkish social studies textbook underscores the value of “solidarity (7)” under the subthemes of “social solidarity” and “international solidarity.” It highlights the importance of solidarity by stating “*Throughout history, societies have established institutions to meet their social assistance, solidarity and security needs*” (Tsst, 2018: 168) and “*The objective of the Organization for Islamic Cooperation is to protect the rights and interests of the Islamic world and to strengthen cooperation and solidarity among the member states*” (Tsst, 2018: 222).

The Iranian social studies textbook lays stress on the value of “solidarity (9)” under the same subthemes as does the Turkish social studies textbook. It contains such statements as “*No one can survive alone*,” “*All living things survive thank to other living things*” (Isst, 2018: 68) and “*The Red Crescent helps people affected by incidents that occur anywhere in the world*.”

Sensitivity

The Turkish social studies textbook speaks of the value of “sensitivity (4)” under the subthemes of “sensitivity to the feelings of others,” “sensitivity to social issues,”

"sensitivity to living things" and "sensitivity to cultural heritage." "Those who share the same feelings can understand each other" (Tsst, 2018: 14), "Ottoman architectural works also took into account the protection of animals" (Tsst, 2018: 86) and "Paper marbling was adopted by the Turkish civilization and it progressed together with calligraphy" (Tsst, 2018: 89) are some examples of this.

The Iranian social studies textbook addresses the value of "sensitivity (4)" under the subthemes of "sensitivity to humanity," "sensitivity to the environment and living things" and "sensitivity to cultural heritage." It highlights the importance of being sensitive to humanity by stating "We learn from the audiovisual media that many people become homeless or sick due to earthquakes, floods, fires and wars that take place all over the world. All these... events show us how beautiful empathy and friendship are" (Isst, 2018: 22) and "We should feel the same not only for fellow citizens, but also for the oppressed all over the world." Chapter 12 entitled "Conservation of Natural Life in Iran" provides many reasons and focuses on increasing students' sensitivity under the headings of "Why Should We Protect Natural Life?" (Isst, 2018: 67) and "How Can We Protect Natural Life?" (Isst, 2018: 69). The textbook reinforces sensitivity through faith by stating "Human is not the only living thing on earth and other living things have the right to live as well because Allah has created them" (Isst, 2018: 68). As for sensitivity to the environment, the textbook states "I should plant trees and keep the environment clean and protect it" (Isst, 2018: 11), "We had a graduation dinner at school last year. I asked all my friends to bring their own plates and spoons, and so, we would not need to use plastics, in this way, we helped protect the environment." As for sensitivity to cultural heritage, the textbook states "Nowruz is a cultural gift of Iran to the world. Did you know that the United Nations declared March 21 as the International Day of Nowruz and officially recognized it?"

Honesty

The Turkish social studies textbook makes no mention of the value of "honesty" while the Iranian social studies textbook addresses (2) it under the subtheme of "being true to one's word." It highlights the value by stating "I should not lie" (Isst, 2018: 7) and "Herodotus wrote that Iranians had three main characteristics; horsemanship, archery and being true to their word" (Isst, 2018: 147).

Aesthetics

The Turkish social studies textbook underlines the value of "aesthetics" under the subthemes of "appreciating aesthetics" and "arts of aesthetic feeling." The textbook contains such statements as "Ottoman architectural

structures reflect the superior aesthetics of the era in which they were built" (Tsst, 2018: 86) and "Calligraphy is the art of writing and decorating beautifully" (Tsst, 2018: 90).

The Iranian social studies textbook places an emphasis on the value of "aesthetics (23)" under the subthemes of "appreciating aesthetics," "arts of aesthetic feeling" and "natural beauties." The statement "Art was quite advanced in Iran" (Isst, 2018: 137) alludes to the appreciation of aesthetics. The textbook refers to the arts of aesthetic feeling by stating "One of the most important pieces of the museum is the Holy Quran written with beautiful calligraphy on gazelle skin" (Isst, 2018: 98), "Some masjids are the most important examples of Islamic architecture" and "Cemşid's throne has a universal reputation in terms of its dimensions" (Isst, 2018: 153). As for natural beauties, the textbook remarks "Some of the best examples of natural life, such as mountains, caves, spring waters, wildlife and forests, are on the World Heritage List" (Isst, 2018: 99).

Equality

The Turkish social studies textbook highlights the value of "equality" under the subthemes of "demand for equality," "equality before the law," "gender equality" and "social equality." The textbook includes such statements as "As a result of the French Revolution, the concepts of nationalism, equality and freedom became important all over the world" (Tsst, 2018: 72), "The principle of equality applies to all in democratic societies. All citizens are equal before the law" (Tsst, 2018: 197), "With the adoption of the Civil Code (17 February 1926), gender equality was achieved in such issues as marriage, divorce and inheritance, thus leading to a significant democratic development" (Tsst, 2018: 204) and "A social state provides its citizens with equal opportunities for economic and social development" (Tsst, 2018: 208).

The Iranian social studies textbook addresses the value of "equality" under the subthemes of "equality before the law" and "equality of access to services." The textbook contains such statements as "Everyone is equal before the law" (Isst, 2018: 17) and "The Red Crescent remains neutral in wars and conflicts and helps people in need, regardless of race, nationality and language" (Isst, 2018: 25).

Freedom

The Turkish social studies textbook makes reference to the value of "freedom (30)" under the subthemes of "appreciating the idea of freedom," "freedom of communication," "freedom of belief and expression," "freedom of travel and settlement," "freedom of education," "freedom of work" and "freedom of the

country.” Some examplesentences are as follows: “*The ideas of equality, justice and freedom have accelerated global democratic movements* (Tsst, 2018: 72), “*Freedom of mass communication is associated with freedom of expression referring to expression of thought by means of words, texts and pictures*” (Tsst, 2018: 31), “*The Ottoman Empire granted non-Muslims rights to freedom of religion and belief and did not interfere with its subjects’ religions, life styles and customs and traditions*” (Tsst, 2018: 69), “*Scholasticism that dominated the medieval Europe prevented people from expressing their ideas freely*” (Tsst, 2018: 148), “*People have the right to travel and settle anywhere. Restricting that rightlimits not only the use of it but also people’s access to work, education and health, and their social and economic rights and freedom* (Tsst, 2018: 118) and “*The objective of NATO is to protect the freedom and security of the member states*” (Tsst, 2018: 221).

The Iranian social studies textbook tackles the value of “freedom (4)” under the subthemes of “absolute freedom” and “personal freedom.” It contains such statements as “*I do not have absolute freedom, but I do have rights that are limited by law*” (Isst, 2018: 14) and “*People have been granted rights and freedom, in other words, people are not servants and slaves but have been granted freedom*” (Isst, 2018: 2).

Respect

The Turkish social studies textbook touches upon the subthemes of “respect for private life,” “respect for differences” and “respect for the will of the nation” to stress the value of “respect (7).” The text on the subject “Freedom of Communication” in the unit entitled “Individual and Society” makes a reference to respect by stating “*Being impartial and respecting private life are the principles by which media organizations should abide*” (Tsst, 2018: 35). As for respect for differences, the unit entitled “Global Connections” states “*One way of ridding us of stereotypes is to recognize and respect differences*” (Tsst, 2018: 230). As for respect for the will of the nation, the textbook states “*This statement shows respect for the will of the nation.*”

The Iranian social studies textbook focuses on the value of “respect (10)” under the subthemes of “respect for family members,” “respect for social rules” and “respect for law.” The textbook states “*I should always respect family members*” (Isst, 2018: 8) and “*For example, it is a social rule to wait in line to get on the bus and everyone must follow it to maintain order*” (Isst, 2018: 17).

Love

The Turkish social studies textbook highlights the value of “love (1)” under the subtheme of “love among family

members” with the statement “*Travelers who wrote that the Ottoman family structure was very strong emphasized the love and affection among the elderly and children*” (Tsst, 2018: 85).

The Iranian social studies textbook emphasizes the value of “love (4)” under the subthemes of “love among family members,” “right to love” and “love for rulers” with such statements as “*Parents are our friends who love us*” (Isst, 2018: 3), “*All children are entitled to love and care by their parents*” (Isst, 2018: 3) and “*Dehyuk, a ruler of the Med society, was loved by all because he was a benevolent and fair ruler*” (Isst, 2018: 118).

Responsibility

The Turkish social studies textbook addresses the value of “responsibility” under the subthemes of “personal responsibility” and “responsibility of the media.” It contains such statements as “*Each family member has rights and responsibilities*” (Tsst, 2018: 211) and “*The language, music, humor, characters and stories that the Media use should be age-appropriate*” (Tsst, 2018: 35).

Responsibility (53) is the second most highlighted value in the Iranian social studies textbook, which approaches it from the subthemes of “individual responsibility,” “fulfillment of citizenship rights and responsibilities,” “corporate responsibility,” “responsibility of the state” and “responsibility to God.” As for individual responsibility, the textbook states “*I should avoid eating junk food and instead eat healthy food and pay attention to my hygiene and sleep*” (Isst, 2018: 7). Regarding fulfillment of citizenship rights and responsibilities, it states “*As a citizen, I should work for the progress and civilization of my country*” (Isst, 2018: 9) and “*Preserving the cultural heritage is not a personal duty but the responsibility of all Iranian citizens*” (Isst, 2018: 28). Concerning corporate responsibility, it says “*Every corporation is responsible for providing health insurance policies for their employees*” (Isst, 2018: 28). As regards responsibility of the state, it states “*The state is responsible for providing equal opportunities to all who wish to work*” (Isst, 2018: 18). To highlight responsibility to God, the textbook contains such expressions as “*I am responsible for worshiping God because He provides me with mind, idea, talent, family, food...and many more hundreds of priceless blessings....I must be grateful...I must not sin...*” (Isst, 2018: 7).

Frugality

The Turkish social studies textbook makes no reference to the value of “frugality.” The Iranian social studies textbook, on the other hand, addresses frugality (13) under the subthemes of “being frugal” and “religious aspect of being frugal.” It provides information on money, credit card, standards, shopping, legal dimension and

frugality under the heading "Spending" (Isst, 2018: 37-42). To emphasize the importance of frugality, the textbook states *"I should not let the water drain while showering or brushing my teeth. I should have dripping taps repaired"* (Isst, 2018: 84) and *"It is a waste of money to buy new furniture every year to keep up with fashion."* As for the religious aspect of being frugal, the textbook states *"Waste is a great sin in Islam"* (Isst, 2018: 40).

Patriotism

The Turkish social studies textbook tackles the value of "patriotism" under the subthemes of "love for cities" and "Atatürk's love for the homeland." The sentences *"Out of love and respect for Akçakoca, the city of Kocaeli and the district of Akçakoca of Düzce were named after him"* (Tsst, 2018: 54) and *"This shows that Mustafa Kemal Atatürk was filled with love for freedom and homeland even in those years"* (Tsst, 2018: 202) emphasizes the value of "patriotism."

The Iranian social studies textbook talks about the value of "patriotism (11)" under the subtheme of "love for the country." To highlight it, the textbook states *"Iran is a large and beautiful country with natural beauties and historical treasures"* (Isst, 2018: 90), *"Iran is our home"* and *"The village where I live now is part of Iran, which is our precious country"* (Isst, 2018: 50).

Altruism

The Turkish social studies textbook mentions the value of "altruism" under the subthemes of "helping those in need" and "social welfare." Some example sentences are *"Turkey has helped many refugees from countries such as Afghanistan, Iraq, Syria and Sudan and guaranteed their safety"* (Tsst, 2018: 120) and *"Offering social assistance to people and other living beings, these institutions have protected human and animal rights"* (Tsst, 2018: 200).

The Iranian social studies textbook concentrates on the value of "altruism (10)" under the subthemes of "helping parents," "helping officers," "helping those in need," "charitable organizations" and "religious aspect of being helpful." To stress altruism, the textbook contains such sentences as *"I help my parents with household chores and help my brothers and sisters..."* (Isst, 2018: 8), *"I help other people and officers to maintain safety"* (Isst, 2018: 9) and *"I help the hurt and the oppressed"* (Isst, 2018: 23). The textbook asserts that recent developments in international relations and communication and transportation technologies have allowed for the institutionalization of charitable activities and presents many international aid organizations such as the Red Crescent and Red Cross as examples (Isst, 2018: 25). For example, it states *"The Red Crescent is an institution*

that sends aid to the victims of natural disasters and wars. The Red Crescent provides first aid to the wounded and takes them to the hospital in the event of an incident" (Isst, 2018: 24). As for the religious aspect of being helpful, the textbook includes *"And whoever saves one - it is as if he had saved mankind entirely,"* which is the 32nd verses (*āyāt*) of the Al Mā'idah chapter (*sūrah*) of the Quran. The textbook furthers its emphasis on altruism by stating *"Allah has commanded that people be empathetic and helpful"* (Isst, 2018: 23).

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

The seventh-grade Turkish social studies textbook written in 2018 based on the updated curriculum highlights the value of scientificity most, followed by freedom, responsibility and sensitivity. This result is consistent with those of previous studies on curricula and textbooks of different grades. Keskin (2008) and Kuş et al. (2011; 2013) found that scientificity, responsibility and sensitivity were the most frequently emphasized values. The Turkish social studies textbook stresses scientificity under the themes of appreciating scientists and appreciating scientific thinking, highlights freedom under the subtheme of freedom of communication, emphasizes responsibility under the subtheme of individual responsibility and underscores sensitivity under the subtheme of sensitivity to cultural heritage. The textbook focuses on the value of love the least and does not make a mention of the values of honesty and frugality at all.

The seventh-grade Iranian social studies textbook highlights sensitivity most, followed by responsibility, scientificity and aesthetics. It stresses sensitivity and responsibility under the same subthemes as does the Turkish social studies textbook. The textbook emphasizes peace the least, which is only once.

The Turkish social studies textbook stresses the value of "caring for family" twice while its Iranian counterpart does it twenty times. As is known, religion, nation, tribe and family play a key role in identity formation (Kamyab, 2014). Most behavior patterns and social learning develop in the family. From birth to early adulthood, the family is the first environment where children observe and develop behavioral patterns. Vergote argues that relatives play the most critical role in the formation of the religious identity of children (1978; in Özkan, 2018) and refers to Joachim Wach, a religious scholar, who states that the religious attitudes of children are greatly affected by those of adults and the environment in which they live, regardless of what culture they live in, and that sociologists make a connection between the psychology of religion and family psychology (Vergote, 1978). The Iranian education system focuses on the Islamization of every aspect of society and the religious-oriented identity formation, and therefore, attaches great importance to family. It is known that Islamic values cannot penetrate

school and everyday life without family support. This could explain why the Iranian social studies textbook highlights family values more frequently than its Turkish counterpart.

The Turkish social studies textbook lays stress on the value of “sensitivity” fourteen times while its Iranian counterpart emphasizes it fifty-five times within the context of national and religious themes, which are believed to be complementary to the value of “sensitivity.” The Iranian social studies textbook portrays the pre-Islamic historical and cultural heritage of Iran as a holistic structure that has been preserved throughout history. It defines the pre-Islamic family structure, table manners and cultural elements (Nawruz etc.) as national values that have been passed on from generation to generation and should be preserved, and holds that the natural environment, including the historical structures, should be preserved as it is created by Allah. The fact that the Iranian social studies textbook makes references to religion for the preservation of national values and uses religion effectively in education and other fields for national purposes has been reported by other studies as well (Pals, 2018; Topaloğlu, 2010; Paivandi, 2012; Mehran, 1989; Mirfakhraie, 2016).

The Iranian social studies textbook highlights the value of “responsibility” ten times more than its Turkish counterpart. However, the former generally emphasizes responsibility within the context of personal responsibility to family and to God, which seems contrary to the nature of social studies that tend to promote general values rather than individual values as stated by Parker (2009).

The Turkish social studies textbook makes no reference to the value of “frugality” whereas its Iranian counterpart stresses it thirteen times, which is in line with the economic conditions of Iran. As is known, Iran's economy is based on the sale of petroleum products. The long Iran-Iraq war after the 1979 Revolution and the international sanctions imposed on Iran due to its nuclear programme cause economic problems, which adversely affect a large part of society. Therefore, the Iranian state encourages the public to perceive being frugal as a religious duty with reference to the Qur'an considering waste to be a great sin.

The Iranian social studies textbook lays stress on the value of “patriotism” more frequently than its Turkish counterpart, which could be interpreted as a reflection of Iran's political position. The Iranian social studies textbook refers to “Iran” as “our home” instead of “our country.” Home, which is a space from a sociological perspective, points to a homogeneous family structure. The fact that the Iranian social studies textbook defines Iran as a big home reveals the homogeneous vision of the “ideal citizen” constructed by the Iranian state discourse. In other words, the Iranian education system aims at creating a homogeneous society of citizens who are obliged to abide by the father, who is the head of household, as a religious duty.

The analysis of the values in the seventh-grade Iranian social studies textbook shows that Iran is a religious nation state that nationalizes religious symbols or attribute religious values to national values to create a homogeneous society embellished with Islamic values. The ideal citizen that the Iranian education system aims to cultivate is the Iranian, Muslim and Shiite citizen, whose greatest duty is to protect the religion and the homeland. The Iranian social studies education plays an important role in cultivating that ideal citizen and functionalizes religion for national purposes rather than emphasizing it. Other studies show that this is not limited to the Iranian social studies education but is also the case for the whole Iranian education system. Hakimzadeh and Mousavi (2009) found that ideological values constituted 45.43% of the Iranian religious education textbooks and pointed out that values education had nothing to do with Islamic values. Hashemi and Ghorbanalizadeh (2015) reported that the ideological values in the Iranian social studies textbooks focused mostly (50.81%) on the formation of national identity. This trend results in people developing an attitude, which warrants further research at different levels (Hedayati et al., 2017b, 2019; Shorehkandi and Aliasgari, 2017).

The seventh-grade Turkish social studies textbook highlights the values of scientificity and freedom the most, both of which refer to universality and Westernization. These two values emphasize social properties rather than individual and religious properties and are therefore consistent with the objectives of social studies education. This result might be due to Turkey's geographical proximity to Europe and its westernization efforts throughout history. The education system as a whole has served as a laboratory for the Westernization efforts undertaken by the Republican regime established after the Empire. The Turkish society was familiar, until recently, with Western values due to the Cold War and the transformations implemented for access into the European Union.

Islam was regarded as the only obstacle to Westernization and was therefore suppressed throughout the history of the Republic. The repressed Islam survived through underground activities carried out by families, small communities or religious communities. Since the early 2000s, Islam has gradually penetrated public life and become a political force that has challenged conventional secularism. As stated by Arjmand (2008), with the political power of Islam, which has always been a potential power against the Westernization project, a social transformation was underway. According to the social studies curriculum revised in 2017, the 2005 curriculum was incomplete in terms of values education (f, 2018). According to the discourse of the political power in Turkey, Western values cause social degeneration, and therefore, the education system should pay more attention to values education. The steps taken to integrate values education into all curricula and

textbooks can be interpreted as an indication of a trend bearing resemblance to what has been observed in Iran.

Different from the Turkish social studies textbook, the Iranian social studies textbook concentrates on the value of responsibility under the subthemes of “corporate responsibility” and “responsibility of the state.” Besides, the Iranian social studies textbook also makes reference to the religious aspects of the values and quotes the Quran, hadiths or prominent figures in history, which might be due to the fact that this method helps students learn values more easily. The two textbooks differ significantly by how frequently they underscore the values. The Iranian social studies textbook highlights the values 30% more frequently than its Turkish counterpart. Education is a process and learning occurs through periodic experiences and emphasis. It is, therefore, recommended that the Turkish social studies textbook makes reference to values more and in a balanced way.

The following suggestions can be made:

- 1) Future studies should make comparative analysis of how frequently social studies textbooks of other grades address values. Such studies can yield more general results regarding the curricula and textbooks of both countries. They can also address different levels of education, curricula and values education in different countries by using qualitative and quantitative methods such as observation, interview and document analysis.
- 2) Future studies can also investigate the effect of values education on Turkish and Iranian students' attitudes. Determining whether there is a relationship between how frequently textbooks address values and the way students develop attitudes will contribute to the field of values education.
- 3) The Iranian social studies textbook has a section titled “A Conversation with Dear Teachers” that explains the content and objectives of the social studies curriculum, and why it is taught and what teachers should be careful about. However, The Turkish social studies textbook has no such section. Adding such a section can help Turkish students to become more aware of what they learn and why they learn it.

CONFLICT OF INTERESTS

The author has not declared any conflict of interests.

REFERENCES

- Adıgüzel A (2010). The status of instructional technology in the primary schools and classroom teachers' level of using these technologies. *Dicle Üniversitesi Ziya Gökalp Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi* 15:1-17.
- Akbaş O (2004). Evaluation of the degree of reaching of affective goals at the elementary level in Turkish national education system 2004. (Thesis). Gazi University, Ankara.
- Akengin H, Tuncel G, Şirin A, Sargin S (2009). A Comparative study on value ranking of the Turkish teaching department students in two universities. *College Student Journal* 43:1191-1203.
- Aktan O, Padem S (2013). İlköğretim 5. sınıf sosyal bilgiler ders kitabında kullanılan okuma metinlerinde yer alan değerler. *Asya Öğretim Dergisi* 1(2):44-55.
- Arijmand R (2008). *Inscription on stone, Islam, state and education in Iran and Turkey*. (Thesis). Stockholm University, Universitetservice US-AB, Sweden.
- Arnove RF (1999). Introduction: Reframing comparative education: The dialectic of the global and the local. In: R. F. Arnove, C. A. Torres (Eds.), *Comparative education: The dialectic of the global and the local*. Boulder: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers.
- Azadmanesh S, Hussein AS (2014). A comparative analysis of the goals of moral education in elementary level in Japan and Iran with respect to the values governing curriculum. *İslam ve Pazhouheshhaye tarbiati* 6-2(12).
- Baydar P (2009). The level of value acquisition which is determined in fifth grade primary school and evaluation of the problems which are encountered in that process. (Thesis). Çukurova University, Adana.
- Bloor M, Wood F (2006). *Keywords in qualitative methods*. London: Sage.
- Büyükoztürk Ş, Çakmak EK, Akgün ÖE, Karadeniz Ş, ve Demirel F (2008). *Bilimsel araştırma yöntemleri [Scientific research methods]*, Ankara: Pegem Akademi.
- Çelikkaya T (2016). The opinion for reasons and value priority of social studies preservice teachers regarding value in social studies curriculum. The 2nd International Conference on the Changing World and Social Research (ICWSR'2016) October, 14-16, 2016, Proceedings Book, 945-962, Barcelona-Spain.
- Çelikkaya T, Esen Z (2017). Mention in the social studies program of proverb, idiom and byword in values education. *Gazi Osman Paşa Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Uluslararası Türk Eğitim Bilimleri Dergisi* 5(9):35-56.
- Çelikkaya T, Kürümlüoğlu M (2018). Yeni Sosyal Bilgiler Programında 4. ve 5. Sınıfta Kazandırılması Hedeflenen Değerlere İlişkin Kazanımların İçeriğe Yansımaları. *Journal of Values Education* 16(36):7-38.
- Demircioğlu İH, Tokdemir MA (2008). The Role of History Education in The Process of Constructing Values: Aims, Functions and Content. *Journal of Values Education* 6(15):69-88.
- Demirhan Işcan IC (2011). Values education and some suggestions to teachers Hacettepe University. *Journal of Education* 40:245-255.
- Dilmaç B (2007). The assessment of the teaching of humane values which are imposed a group of science high school students by humane values scale. (Thesis). Selçuk University, Konya.
- Dilmaç B, Ekşi H (2007). Basic discussions and approaches in values education. *İlköğretmen Eğitimi Dergisi* 14:21-29.
- Doğanay A (2006). Değerler eğitimi. *Hayat bilgisi ve sosyal bilgiler öğretimi*, (Ed. Öztürk C), Ankara: Pegem Yayıncılık pp. 255-286.
- Ekşi H (2003). Character education programs: An approach for acquiring core human values. *Journal of Values Education* 1:79-96.
- Ercan İ (2001). National and universal values in primary school social studies curriculum. (Thesis). University of Onsekiz Mart, Çanakkale.
- Farjad M (2000). Development of comparing different educational systems. Iran: Tehran. Roshd.
- Fraser S, Brickman WW (1968). *A history of international and comparative education: Nineteenth century documents*, Glenview: Scott Foresman.
- Genç K (2018). Evaluation of citizenship in Turkey and Iran according to teachers' views 2018. (Thesis). Sakarya University, Sakarya.
- Güngör E (1993). *Değerler psikolojisi. [Psychology of values]*, Amsterdam: Netherlands Turkish Academics Association Foundation Publications.
- Hakimzadeh R, Mousavi SA (2009). Values education in middle school textbooks: strategies towards desired situation through a review of the status quo. *Journal of Curriculum Studies* 13(11):95-117.
- Hashemi SZ, Ghorbanalizadeh (2015). National identity in elementary social studies textbooks. *National studies*, 15(4)60:49-71.
- Hedayati N, Kuusisto E, Gholami K, Tirri K (2017a). Value learning trajectories in Iranian educational system. In: Value learning trajectories. (eds) Kuusisto A, Gearon L. pp179-193. Münster Germany: Waxman.
- Hedayati N, Kuusisto E, Gholami K, Tirri K (2017b). Gender-Specific

- Religious Moral Dilemmas in Iranian Schools. The Power of Resistance (Advances in Education in Diverse Communities), Emerald Publishing Limited 12:365-381. <https://doi.org/10.1108/S1479-358X20140000012017>
- Hedayati N, Kuusisto E, Gholami K, Tirri K (2019). Moral conflicts in Iranian secondary schools. *Journal of Beliefs & Values* 40:1-14 <https://doi.org/10.1080/13617672.2019.1618151>
- Higgins P, Shoar-Ghaffari P (1996). Iranian identity in elementary textbooks. In Elizabeth Warnock Fernea (Ed.), *Children in the Muslim Middle East*. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Hilker F (1962). *Vergleichende pädagogik: Eine Einführung in ihre Geschichte, Theorie und Praxis*. München: Max Hueber Verlag.
- İmamoğlu EO, Karakitapoğlu-Aygün Z (1999). 1970'lerden 1990'lara değerler: Üniversite düzeyinde gözlenen zaman, kuşak ve cinsiyet farklılıkları [Values from 1970s to 1990s: Time, generation and gender differences observed at university level], *Türk Psikoloji Dergisi* 14(44):1-22.
- Ho H, Hsu Y (2011). Improving the textbook adoption process in Taiwan. *International Education Studies* 4(4):92-98. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/ies.v4n4p92>
- Imani N (2017). An evaluation of the quality of acceptance of multicultural values in educational settings: An anthropological study. *Journal of Curriculum Studies* 11(43):99-124.
- İsht (2018). Iran social studies textbook. [Mutalâ'at-ı İctima'î], Tehran: Iranian Ministry of Education Publications.
- Kale N (2007). Nasıl bir değerler eğitimi? Değerler Eğitimi Uluslararası Sempozyumu pp. 313-322, İstanbul: Değerler Eğitimi Merkezi Yayınları.
- Kaloyannaki P, Kazamias M (2009). The modernist beginnings of comparative education: The proto-scientific and the reformist-meliorist administrative motif. *Second international handbook of comparative education*, (Eds. R. Cowen & A. M. Kazamias) 1:11-36.
- Kamyab S (2014). Education and religion in Iran: An annotated bibliography. In: *International comparative perspective on religion and education*. (Eds. Charl Wolhuter, Corene de Wet) pp. 255-270.
- Kan Ç (2010). Sosyal bilgiler dersi ve değerler eğitimi. *Milli Eğitim Dergisi* 187:138-145.
- Katılmış A, Ekşi H, Öztürk C (2010). Sosyal bilgiler dersi kazanımlarıyla bütünleştirilmiş bilimsellik odaklı karakter eğitimi programının etkililiği. *Sosyal Bilgiler Eğitimi Araştırmaları Dergisi* 1(1):50-87.
- Karaca F (2011). İlköğretim öğretmenleri derslerinde ne tür öğretim araç ve gereçleri kullanılmaktadır? Selçuk Üniversitesi Ahmet Keleşoğlu Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi 32:131-148.
- Kenan S (2009). Modern eğitimde kaybolan nokta: Değerler eğitimi. *Kuram ve Uygulamada Eğitim Bilimleri* 9:259-295.
- Keskin Y (2008). Values education in social studies curriculum at Turkey: Historical development, researching of 1998 and 2004 curriculum effectiveness 2008. (Thesis). Marmara University, İstanbul.
- Kılıç A, Seven S (2002). Konu alanı ders kitabı incelemesi. [Subject area textbook review], Ankara: Pegem Yayıncılık.
- Kıncal R, Isık H (2005). Elementary school principal's level of practicing democratic values. *International Journal of Educational Reform* 14(3):326-333.
- Kızılcılık S, Erjem Y (1994). Açıklamalı sosyoloji terimleri sözlüğü. [Glossary of sociology terms], Ankara: Atilla Kitabevi.
- Koç K (2007). İlköğretim 7. sınıflarda okutulan vatandaşlık ve insan hakları eğitimi dersinde öğrenciye kazandırılması amaçlanan evrensel değerlere ilişkin tutumlar üzerinde öğretim sürecinin etkisi. (Thesis) Firat University, Elazığ.
- Kuş Z, Meray Z, Karatekin K (2011). A qualitative study on the values in the primary school social studies textbooks (National education publications example). Paper presented at the Symposium on Values Education 26-28 October 2011, Osmangazi University, Eskişehir.
- Kuş Z, Meray Z, Karatekin K (2013). Values found in elementary 4th and 5th grade social studies textbooks. *Journal of Values Education* 11(25):183-214.
- Mehran G (1989). The Socialization of Schoolchildren in the Islamic Republic of Iran: A Study of Social Studies Textbooks. *Iranian Studies* 22(1):35-50.
- Mehran G (1990). Ideology and education in the Islamic Republic of Iran. *Compare* 20(1):53-65.
- Mehran G (2003). Khatami, political reform and education in Iran. *Comparative Education* 39(3):311-329.
- Mehran G (2010). Representations of Arabs in Iranian elementary school textbooks. In: Andre E. Mazawi, Ronald G. Sultana (eds), *Education and the Arab World*. London New York: Routledge.
- Mehrmohammadi M (2013). Reassessment of the associated with values education theories in the education system from an effectiveness perspective. *Journal of Educational Innovations* 11(46):79-97.
- Meray Z, Kuş Z, Karatekin K (2012). Comparison of elementary social studies curricula of Turkey and the United States on values education. *Educational Sciences: Theory Practice* 12(2) [Supplementary Special Issue]:1613-1632.
- Miles MB, Huberman AM (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded source book*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Mirfakhraie A (2015). Racialization of Asia, Africa and the Americas, and the construction of the ideal Iranian citizen: Local and global representations of colonialism, geography, culture and religious diversity in Iranian school textbook. In: *Africa's many divides and Africa's future*, (Eds. Charles Quist-Adde, Vincent Dodo). Cambridge Scholars Publishing, pp. 217-253.
- Mirfakhraie A (2016). Social Justice; Anti-imperialist, Racist, Persian-centric, and Shi'i-centric Discursive Formations of the Ideal Citizen and Iranian School Textbooks: A Social Biography Response. *Iran's Struggles for Social Justice*. (Ed. Vahabzadeh P), Palgrave Macmillan, Cham pp. 99-125.
- Ministry of National Education (MoNE) (2011). İlköğretim sosyal bilgiler dersi 6-7 sınıflar öğretim programı ve kılavuzu. Ankara.
- Ministry of National Education (MoNE) (2018). Ministry of National Education, Social studies course curriculum, <http://mufredat.meb.gov.tr/Dosyalar/201812103847686-SOSYAL%20B%C4%B0LG%C4%B0LER%20%C3%96%C4%9ERE T%C4%B0M%20PROGRAMI%20.pdf>
- National Council for the Social Studies (NCSS) (1994). National Council for the Social Studies: Expectations of excellence, national curriculum standards for social studies. Washington, D.C.: NCSS.
- National Council for the Social Studies (NCSS). (2010). National council for the social studies. National curriculum standards for social studies: A framework for teaching, learning, and assessment. Washington, D.C.: NCSS.
- Noah H, Eckstein M (1969). *Toward a science of comparative education*. London: Collier Macmillan.
- Özkan F (2018). Ailenin dini tutum ve davranışlarının çocuğun dini tutum ve davranışlarına etkisi: Diyarbakır örneği. *Mizanü'l-Hak: İslami İlimler Dergisi* (7):63-109. Retrieved from <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/mizan/issue/42354/509813>.
- Paivandi S (2012). The future of Iran: Educational reform education in the Islamic Republic of Iran and perspectives on democratic reforms. Dubai: Legatum Institute, pdfs.semanticscholar.org
- Pals P (2018). The presentation of the Islamic Republic of Iran in Iranian primary schoolbooks: An interplay of religion and nationalism. (Thesis). Holland: Leiden University.
- Parker WC (2009). *Social studies in elementary education*. Boston: Pearson Education Inc.
- Rust VD, Johnstone B, Allaf C (2009). Reflections on the development of comparative education, *International handbook of comparative education I*, (Eds. Cowen, R, Kazamias AM) pp.121-138.
- Sar E (2005). Öğretmen adaylarının değer tercihleri: Giresun Eğitim Fakültesi örneği. *Değerler Eğitimi Dergisi* 3(10):73-88.
- Sarlak N, Saadatmand Z (2013). Content analysis of social education textbooks of Iran's primary and secondary schools with emphasis on citizenship education component from teacher's perspective on Isfahan. *Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review* 2(11):80-87.
- Schwartz SH (1992). Universals in the content and structure of values: Theoretical advances and empirical tests in 20 countries. *Advances in Experimental Social Psychology* 25:1-65.
- Schwartz SH, Melech G, Lehmann A, Burgess S, Harris M, Owens V (2001). Extending the cross-cultural validity of the theory of basic human values with a different method of measurement. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology* 32(5):519-542. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Shalom_Schwartz.
- Shorehkandi F, Aliasgari M (2017). Compared to teach primary school

- children in accordance with islamic values in the countries of the Islamic Republic of Iran and Azerbaijan. Curriculum Planning Knowledge & Research In Educational Sciences 14, 26(53):47-55.
- Silah M (2000). *Sosyal psikoloji* (Davranış bilimi) [social psychology-behavioral science]. Ankara: Gazi Publishing.
- Soltan-zadeh M, Farouk MK (2010). A comparison of national and Islamic concepts in the social studies textbooks of Iran. Interculturalism, society and education. (Eds. Pompanini, G, Adly F, Napier D) pp.45-55, Sense publishers.
- Suphi ME (2010). Citizenship and ethnicity in Turkey and Iran 2010. (Thesis). METU, Ankara.
- Tezcan M (1997). Eğitim sosyolojisi [Sociology of education] Ankara.
- Tezgel R (2006). Yeni ilköğretim sosyal bilgiler dersi öğretim programında insan hakları ve değer eğitimi. II. Uygulamalı Etik Kongresi Bildiri Kitabı pp. 637-645. Ankara: ODTÜ Yayınları.
- Topaloğlu F (2010). Şia'nın oluşumunda İran kültürünün etkisi. (Thesis). İzmir: Dokuz Eylül Üniversitesi.
- Topkaya Y, Tokcan H (2013). Sosyal bilgiler öğretim programının belirlediği değerlerin 6. sınıf sosyal bilgiler ders kitaplarına yansıma düzeylerinin karşılaştırılması. Uluslararası Avrasya Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi 4(10):33-43.
- Topkaya EZ, Yavuz A (2011). Democratic values and teacher self-efficacy perceptions: A case of pre-service english language teachers in Turkey. Australian Journal of Teacher Education 36:32-49.
- Tozlu N, Topsakal C (2007). Avrupa birliğine uyum çerçevesinde değerler eğitimi. Değerler Eğitimi Uluslararası Sempozyumu Bildiriler Kitabı pp.177-202, İstanbul.
- Tsst (2018). Turkish social studies textbook 7. Ankara: Ministry of National Education Publications.
- Vergote A (1978). Çocuklukta Din. çev. Erdoğan Fırat, Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi 22:315-329.
- Yazdani S, Maryam AL (2017). Explanation and clarification of the concept of value in medical education. Journal of research on religion and health 3(2):88-101.
- Yıldırım A, Şimşek H (2005). Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri [Research methods in social sciences], 5. Edition, Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.
- Yiğittir S, Öcal A (2011). Lise tarih öğretmenlerinin değerler ve değerler eğitimi konusundaki görüşleri. Karamanoğlu Mehmetbey Üniversitesi, Sosyal ve Ekonomik Araştırmalar Dergisi 13(20):117-124.
- Zarean MJ (1998). Islamic values and their reflection in the Iranian elementary textbooks: Islamization in post-revolutionary Iran. (Thesis), Montreal: McGill University.